

The Matrix Evidence Tables

NEUROLOGICAL DISORDERS

CLICK ANYWHERE TO CONTINUE



The Scottish
Government

RECOMMENDATION

A	Highly recommended
B	Recommended
C	No evidence to date but opinion suggests that this therapy might be helpful

Matrix: Level of evidence	Recommendation	
A At least one meta-analysis, systematic review, or RCT of high quality and consistency aimed at target Population	A	Highly recommended
B Well-conducted clinical studies but no randomised clinical trials on the topic of recommendation directly applicable to the target population, and demonstrating overall consistency of results	B	Recommended
C Widely held expert opinion but no available or directly applicable studies of good quality.	C	No evidence to date but opinion suggests that this therapy might be helpful

SUMMARY

THIS SECTION COVERS
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR
PSYCHOLOGICAL THERAPIES FOR
THE MOST COMMON AND RELEVANT
NEUROLOGICAL DISORDERS IN
YOUNG ADULTS AGED 16-64.

A significant portion of study samples in the reviewed studies are within this age group. It includes psychological therapies for mental health issues but not cognitive techniques or treatments for cognitive problems. In the absence of good research evidence for a particular intervention in a particular neurological population, clinical judgement should be used if considering interventions which have been shown to be effective for similar problems in other adult populations.

BRAIN INJURY

DEFINITION

Acquired Brain Injury (ABI) is an umbrella term that is defined by the SIGN 130 guideline¹ as implying “damage to the brain that was sudden in onset and occurred after birth and the neonatal period. It is thus differentiated from birth injuries, congenital abnormalities and progressive or degenerative diseases affecting the central nervous system.”

“This definition permits the inclusion of open or closed traumatic head injuries, and non-traumatic causes, such as vascular incidents (e.g. stroke), infection (e.g. meningitis), hypoxic injuries (e.g. cardiorespiratory arrest), or toxic or metabolic insult (e.g. hypoglycaemia).”¹

Traumatic Brain Injury (TBI) is the most common form of brain injury, in young adults. TBI is defined by the SIGN 130⁴ guideline as a traumatically induced structural injury and/or physiological disruption of brain function as a result of an external force that is indicated by new onset or worsening of at least one of the following clinical signs, immediately following the event:

- Any period of decreased level or loss of consciousness
- Any loss of memory for events immediately before or after the injury
- Any alteration in mental state at the time of the injury (confusion, disorientation, slowed thinking, etc.)
- Neurological deficits (weakness, loss of balance, change in vision, praxis, paresis/ plegia, sensory loss, aphasia, etc) that may not be transient
- Intracranial lesion

BRAIN INJURY

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ACQUIRED BRAIN INJURY

Level of Severity	Level of Service	Intensity of Intervention	What Intervention?	Recommendation
Moderate to Severe	Highly Specialist / Tertiary Care	High	Holistic Neurorehabilitation*	A ^{1,2,3,4}
	Secondary	High	Group CBT for anger management and /or emotional distress reduction	C ⁵

*N.B. Holistic Neurorehabilitation is a multidisciplinary model to work with the individual as an entity rather than working on single areas of difficulty. Key is the development of insight, adjustment and adaptive skills, the use of psychotherapy and the involvement of the family in rehabilitation to facilitate the focus on generalisation from the rehabilitation environment to the community.³

BRAIN INJURY

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR TRAUMATIC BRAIN INJURY

Level of Severity	Level of Service	Intensity of Intervention	What Intervention?	Recommendation
Mild	Secondary	Low	Information, support and advice to reduce social morbidity and severity of 'post-concussion' symptoms	A ⁷
			Information booklet and coping strategies to reduce 'post-concussion' symptoms and stress	B ⁶
Mild to Moderate	Secondary	Low	Online CBT, plus telephone follow up for depression	C ⁸
			Group mindfulness-based stress reduction (MBSR) for depression	C ⁹
Moderate to Severe	Highly specialist or Tertiary Care	High	Holistic Neurorehabilitation	A ^{1,3,4}

*N.B. There is limited but encouraging evidence for using CBT plus Cognitive Remedial Therapy for depression and anxiety; more evidence is required¹⁰.

STROKE

DEFINITION

The World Health Organisation definition of stroke is "a clinical syndrome of rapidly developed clinical signs of focal or global disturbance of cerebral function, lasting more than 24 hours or leading to death with no apparent cause other than vascular origin."¹¹

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR STROKE

Level of Severity	Level of Service	Intensity of Intervention	What Intervention?	Recommendation
Adjustment to disability and depression acutely post stroke	Secondary	Low	Motivational Interviewing improved outcome at three month post-stroke follow-up	A ¹²

Further information on evidence:

- i. A Cochrane review (2008)¹³ suggested that there was insufficient evidence to support psychological interventions for treatment of post-stroke depression. SIGN 118 (2010)¹⁴ reached a similar conclusion. Diagnosis may be complicated by the overlap between symptoms of depression or anxiety and physical or cognitive changes associated with stroke. Care must be taken not to regard patients' and carers' natural reactions to stroke as pathological.
- ii. A recent RCT suggested behavioural therapy might improve the mood of people with aphasia at three month post-intervention.¹⁵ However, similar conclusions were not supported by other studies.^{15, 16, 17} Further studies are recommended.

EPILEPSY

DEFINITIONS

Epilepsy is “a neurological condition characterised by recurrent epileptic seizures unprovoked by any immediately identifiable cause”. An epileptic seizure is the clinical manifestation of an abnormal and excessive discharge of a set of neurons in the brain as defined in the NICE guideline [CG137]¹⁹

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR EPILEPSY

Level of Service	Intensity of Intervention	What Intervention?	Recommendation
Secondary	High	CBT for depression	C ^{20, 21}

* N.B. RCT evidence for CBT for depression for those with epilepsy is inconsistent.

MULTIPLE SCLEROSIS

DEFINITION

The NICE guideline 186²², defines Multiple Sclerosis (MS) as “an acquired chronic immunemediated inflammatory condition of the central nervous system (CNS), affecting both the brain and spinal cord”.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR MULTIPLE SCLEROSIS

Symptoms	Level of Service	Intensity of Intervention	What Intervention?	Recommendation
Distress	Secondary	Low	Group CBT	A ²⁷
		Low/High	Individual CBT, group CBT and telephone administered CBT	A ²⁶
		High	Telephone based individual CBT	A ²³
			Stress management to reduce stress	A ²⁴
			CBT based adjustment group to improve distress	A ²⁵
Fatigue	Secondary	High	Group CBT	A ²⁸
			Group Mindfulness	A ²⁹

*N.B. A Cochrane review (2008)³⁰ suggested that cognitive behaviour approaches could also be beneficial in helping people adjust to and cope with Multiple Sclerosis. However, evidence is limited, further studies are recommended.

PARKINSON'S DISEASE

DEFINITION

NICE guideline 35³¹ defines Parkinson's Disease (PD) as "a progressive neurodegenerative condition resulting from the death of the dopamine-containing cells of the substantia nigra".

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PARKINSON'S DISEASE

Symptoms	Level of Service	Intensity of Intervention	What Intervention?	Recommendation
Depression	Secondary	High	Individual CBT for depression	A ³²
Impulse control behaviours	Secondary	High	Group CBT for Impulse control behaviour	B ³³
Worry	Secondary	Low	Group CBT based guided self-help book/ resource for worries	A ³⁴

REFERENCE SECTION

1 of 4

1. Scottish Intercollegiate Guidelines Network (2013) Brain injury rehabilitation in adults. 130. Edinburgh. Scottish Intercollegiate Guideline Network
2. Cattalani, R., Zettin, M., & Zoccolotti, P. (2010). Rehabilitation Treatments for Adults with Behavioral and Psychosocial Disorders Following Acquired Brain Injury: A Systematic Review. *Neuropsychology Review*, 20(1), 52-85. doi: 10.1007/s11065-009-9125-y
3. Cicerone, K. D., Langenbahn, D. M., Braden, C., Malec, J. F., Kalmar, K., Fraas, M., Ashman, T. (2011). Evidence-Based Cognitive Rehabilitation: Updated Review of the Literature From 2003 Through 2008. *Archives of Physical Medicine & Rehabilitation*, 92(4), 519-530. doi: 10.1016/j.apmr.2010.11.015
4. McMillan, T. (2013). Outcome of Rehabilitation for Neurobehavioral Disorders. *NeuroRehabilitation*, 32 (2013), 791-801. doi: 10.3233/NRE-130903
5. Bradbury, C. L., Christensen, B. K., Lau, M. A., Ruttan, L. A., Arundine, A. L., and Green, R. E. (2008). The Efficacy of Cognitive Behavior Therapy in the Treatment of Emotional Distress after Acquired Brain Injury. *Archives of Physical Medicine & Rehabilitation*, 89(12), S61-68. doi:10.1016/j.apmr.2008.08.210
6. Ponsofrd, J., Willmott, C., Rothwell, A., Cameron, P., Kelly, A.M., Nelms, R., and Curran, C. (2002) Impact of Early Intevention on Outcome Following Mild Head Injury in Adults. *Journal of Neurology, Neurosurgery & Psychiatry*. 73: 330-332. doi:10.1136/jnnp.73.3.330
7. Wade, D.T., King, N.S., Wenden, F.J., Crawford, S. and Caldwell, F.E. (1998) Routine Follow Up After Head Injury: A Second Randomised Controlled Trial. *Journal of Neurology, Neurosurgery & Psychiatry*. 65:177-183. doi:10.1136/jnnp.65.2.177
8. Topolovec-Vranic, J., Cullen, N., Michalak, A., Ouchterlony, D., Bhalerao, S., Masanic, C., and Cusimano, M. D. (2010). Evaluation of An Online Cognitive Behavioural Therapy Program by Patients with Traumatic Brain Injury and Depression. *Brain Injury*, 24(5), 762-772. doi: 10.3109/02699051003709599
9. Bédard, M., Felteau, M., Marshall, S., Cullen, N., Gibbons, C., Dubois, S., Moustgaard, A. (2013). Mindfulness-Based Cognitive Therapy Reduces Symptoms of Depression in People With a Traumatic Brain Injury: Results From a Randomized Controlled Trial. *The Journal of Head Trauma Rehabilitation*. 26(3) DOI: 10.1097/HTR.0b013e3182a615a0

REFERENCES

2 of 4

10. Ponsford, J. (2005) Rehabilitation Interventions after Mild Head Injury. *Current Opinion in Neurology*. 18(6): 692-697
11. Hatano, S. (1976) Experience from a Multicentre Stroke Register: A Preliminary Report. *Bulletin of World Health Organisation*. 54(5): 541–553. [9]
12. Watkins, C.L., Auton, M.F., Deans, C.F., Dickinson, H.A., Jack, C.I.A., Lightbody, C.E., Sutton, C.J., van den Broek, M.D. and Leathley, M.J. (2007), Motivational Interviewing Early After Acute Stroke- A Randomised Controlled Trial, *Stroke*. 38:1004-1009. doi: 10.1161/01.STR.0000258114.28006.d7
13. Hackett, M.L., Anderson, C.S., House, A.O., and Xia, J. (2008). Interventions for Treating Depression after Stroke. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2008 (4). doi: 10.1161/01.STR.0000162391.27991.9d [10]
14. Scottish Intercollegiate Guidelines Network (2010) Management of Patients with Stroke: Rehabilitation, Prevention and Management of Complications and Discharge Planning 118. Edinburgh. Scottish Intercollegiate Guideline Network
15. Thomas, S.A., Walker, M.F., MacNiven, J.A., Haworth, H., and Lincoln, N.B. (2012) Communication and Low Mood (CALM):A Randomised Controlled Trial of Behavioural Therapy for Stroke Patients with Aphasia. *Clinical Rehabilitation*. 27(5): 398-408. DOI: 10.1177/0269215512462227
16. Johnston, M., Bonetti, D., Joice, S., Pollard, B., Morrison, V.a, Francis, J.J. and MacWalter, R. (2007) Recovery from Disability after Stroke as a Target for a Behavioural Intervention: Results of a Randomized Controlled Trial. 29(14): 1117-1127. DOI: 10.1080/03323310600950411
17. Lincoln, N.B and Flannaghan, T., (2002). Cognitive Behavioral Psychotherapy for Depression Following Stroke: A Randomized Controlled Trial. *Stroke*. 34: 111-115. doi: 10.1161/01.STR.0000044167.44670.55
18. Lincoln, N. B., Flannaghan, T., Sutcliffe, L., & Rother, L. (1997). Evaluation of Cognitive Behavioural Treatment for Depression after Stroke: A Pilot Study. *Clinical Rehabilitation*, 11(2), 114-122.
19. National Institute for Health and Care Excellence [CG137] (2012) The Epilepsies: The Diagnosis and Management of the Epilepsies in Adults and Children in Primary and Secondary Care. Pharmacological Updates of Clinical Guideline 20. London, National Clinical Guideline Centre
20. Gandy, M., Sharpe, L., and Perry, K.N. (2013) Cognitive Behaviour Therapy for Depression in People with Epilepsy: A Systematic Review. *Epilepsia*. 54(10): 1725-1734. doi: 10.1111/epi.12345
21. Ramaratnam, S., Baker, G.A., and Goldstein, L.H. (2008) Psychological Treatment for Epilepsy (Review), *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*

REFERENCES

3 of 4

2008(3).

22. National Institute for Health and Care Excellence [CG186] (2014) Multiple Sclerosis: Management of Multiple Sclerosis in Primary and Secondary Care. London, National Clinical Guideline Centre

23. Moss-Morris, R., Dennison, L., Landau, S., Yardley, L., Silber, E., and Chalder, T. (2013) A Randomize Controlled Trial of Cognitive Behavioural Therapy (CBT) for Adjusting to Multiple Sclerosis (the saMS trial): Does CBT Works and for Whom Does It Work? *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*. 81 (2): 251-262. doi: 10.1037/a0029132.

24. Artemiadis, A.K., Vervainioti, A.A., Alexopoulos, E.V., Rombos, A., Anagnostouli, M.C., and Darviri, C. (2012) Stress Management and Multiple Sclerosis: A Randomise Controlled Trial. *Archives of Clinical Neuropsychology*. 27: 406-416. Doi:10.1093/arclin/acs039

25. Lincoln, N.B., Yuill, F., Holmes, J., Drummond, A.E.R., Constantinescu, C.S., Armstrong, S., and Phillips, C., (2011) Evaluation of An Adjustment Group for People with Multiple Sclerosis and Low Mood: A Randomised Controlled Trial. *Multiple Sclerosis Journal*. 17 (10): 1250-1257. Doi:10.1177/1352458511408753

26. Hind, D., Cotter, J., Thake, A., Bradburn, M., Cooper, C., Isaac, C., and House, A., (2014) Cognitive Behavioural Therapy for Treatment of Depression in People with Multiple Sclerosis: A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis. *BMC Psychiatry*. 14: 5. doi:10.1186/1471-244X-14-5

27. Graziano, F., Calandri, E., Borghi, M. and Bonino, S., (2014) The Effects of A Group-based Cognitive Behavioural Therapy on People with Multiple Sclerosis: A Randomised Controlled Trial. *Clinical Rehabilitation*. 28(3) 264-274. DOI: 10.1177/0269215513501525

28. Thomas, P.W., Thomas, S., Kersten, P., Jones, R., Slingsby, V., Nock, A., Davies Smith, A., Baker, R., Galvin, K.T. and Hillier, C. (2014) One Year Follow-up of A Pragmatic Multi-centre Randomised Controlled Trial of a Group-based Fatigue Management Programme (FACETS) for People with Multiple Sclerosis. *BMC Neurology*, 14:109. doi:10.1186/1471-2377-14-109

29. Grossman, P., Kappos, L., Gensicke, H., D'Souza, M., Mohr, D.C., Penner, I.K., Steiner, C. (2010) MS Quality of Life, Depression, and Fatigue Improve After Mindfulness Training: a Randomised Trial. *Neurology*. 75 (13): 1141- 1149. doi: 10.1212/WNL.0b013e3181f4d80d

30. Thomas, P.W., Thomas, S., Hillier, C., Galvin, K., and Baker, R. (2008) Psychological Interventions for Multiple Sclerosis (Review). *Cochrane Database of*

REFERENCES

4 of 4

Systematic Reviews 2009(1).

31. National Institute for Health and Care Excellence [CG35] (2006) Parkinson's Disease: Diagnosis and Management in Primary and Secondary Care. London, National Clinical Guideline Centre
32. Dobkin, R.D., Menza, M., Allen, L.A., Gara, M.A., Mark, M.H., Tiu, J., Bienfait, K.I. and Friedman, J. (2011) Cognitive-behaviour Therapy for Depression in Parkinson's Disease: A Randomised, Controlled Trial. *American Journal of Psychiatry*. 168 (10): 1066-1074
33. Okai, D., Askey-Jones, S., Samuel, M., O'Sullivan, S.S., Chaudhuri, K.R., Martin, A., Mack, Jo., Brown, R.G. and David, A.S. (2013) Trial of CBT for Impulse Control Behaviours Affecting Parkinson Patients and Their Caregivers. *Neurology*. 80(9): 792-799. doi: 10.1212/WNL.0b013e3182840678
34. Lawson, R.A., Millar, D., Brown, R.G. and Burn, D.J. (2013) Guided Self-Help for the Management of Worry in Parkinson's disease: A Pilot Study. *Journal of Parkinson's Disease*. 3(1):61-68. Doi:10.3233/JPD-120156

CONTRIBUTORS

Kate Davidon, Professor of Clinical Psychology, Institute of Health and Wellbeing, University of Glasgow

Tom McMillan, Professor of Clinical Neuropsychology, Institute of Health and Wellbeing, University of Glasgow

Kelly Chung, Researcher, Institute of Health and Wellbeing, University of Glasgow



NHS Education for Scotland
Westport 102
West Port
Edinburgh EH3 9DN
tel: 0131 656 3200
fax: 0131 656 3201
www.nes.scot.nhs.uk

© NHS Education for Scotland 2015

You can copy or reproduce the information in this document for use within NHSScotland and for non-commercial educational purposes. Use of this document for commercial purposes is permitted only with the written permission of NES.

NESD0366 | Designed and typeset by the NES Design Service.